

SHERWIN-WILLIAMS.



**Sherwin-Williams Headquarters
Final Design Submission:**

- Sherwin-Williams Responses
- Public Comments

December 2021

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS****SHERWIN-WILLIAMS RESPONSES TO PUBLIC COMMENTS ON FINAL HQ DESIGN**

The Sherwin-Williams Company submitted to the City of Cleveland Planning Commission its final design package on Tuesday, November 16, 2021. As part of the design review process, the public was encouraged to submit to the Planning Commission comments on our final design submission. Those comments were collected by the City of Cleveland and shared with Sherwin-Williams just prior to the final design review public meeting held on Tuesday, November 30.

Sherwin-Williams wishes to thank all those who submitted comments on our headquarters final design. We are excited to remain in the city where our Company was founded and build our new global headquarters in the heart of downtown Cleveland. And we appreciate those who took the time to provide us with their thoughtful comments, feedback and insight into our headquarters design.

The full set of public comments are enclosed within this document. After we reviewed the comments, it was evident that the majority of the submitted comments were related to how our campus design might influence migratory bird patterns. This topic is addressed below.

INFLUENCE ON MIGRATORY BIRD INTERACTION

Sherwin-Williams understands that the design of our new headquarters complex may negatively affect migratory bird behavior. To better understand the potential implications, the Company has engaged an avian consultant, BirdMaster, to assist us in assessing how our campus design may affect migratory and resident bird welfare. In addition, the consultant will provide us with recommendations and strategies to ensure we balance our campus design and operational needs with those of the migratory bird population.

While it is still early in the consultation process, Sherwin-Williams, in concert with our consultant, has established an initial strategy which takes a tiered approach to minimizing elements that attract birds to our campus and to our buildings. There are several areas of focus, including:

A. Minimize attracting birds to the campus**Foodstuffs**

- Aggressively remove trash and accidental food spillage from the surrounding campus.
- Limit street food vendors operating nearby and routinely clean any outdoor dining areas.

Lighting

- Reduce up-lighting on buildings that may cause a “beacon effect”.
- Control lighting at the lower three levels of buildings, at a minimum, during the migratory bird periods. Sherwin-Williams has engaged with Lights-Out Cleveland to understand and collaborate on best practices.

Nesting and Resting Area Locations

- Minimize potential nesting and resting areas on and around the campus by avoiding the use of green roofs and other undisturbed green areas through appropriate placement of landscaping surrounding the buildings.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

B. Minimize attracting birds to our buildings.

- Limit interior greenery/landscaping near window edges.
- Minimize accent lighting on artwork, sculptures and hardscaping.
- Use frits, signage, nets, shades and other techniques to discourage attracting birds.

C. Inspect – Document – Adjust

Our campus buildings will be inspected on a regular basis for signs of bird interactions which will be documented and, if needed, we will adjust our strategy to ensure Sherwin-Williams continues to balance its operational needs with the wellbeing of the migratory and resident bird populations. Our bird safety program will include training maintenance and security personnel to identify “hot spots” where there is greater bird activity. The team will be responsible for documenting when, where and date of bird contacts occur, then implement additional visual noise techniques, if needed, to address future bird contact.

Over the coming months, our avian consultant will be developing a more comprehensive strategy, building upon the outlined initial approach.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

From: Joel Throckmorton

Sent: Wednesday, November 24, 2021 1:12 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ

Dear Mr. Bowman and City of Cleveland Planning Commission,

I am writing to you representing the Natural Resources Division of the City of Mentor. We are encouraging you to look into this matter regarding the Sherwin Williams new corporate headquarters. We commend Sherwin Williams for building their new corporate headquarters in Cleveland but strongly believe the new building should use sustainable and bird-friendly glass in its construction. This would be a strong example for future companies who build in Cleveland and would showcase Cleveland as an eco-friendly and bird-friendly city. Attached you will find our Division's thoughts and concerns.

Most Sincerely,

Joel Throckmorton

Attachment:

November 24, 2021

By email: cityplanning@clevelandohio.gov

**RE: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ
Downtown Cleveland/Jacobs Block & Weston Block**

Dear Chairman Bowen:

We are writing on behalf of The City of Mentor's Natural Resources Division, a member of the Lake Erie Allegheny Partnership (LEAP). LEAP members are dedicated to the preservation of natural lands, reduction of stresses on natural ecosystems, and promotion of biodiversity in the Lake Erie region. Our Division represents those values and is writing to strongly urge the Cleveland Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company modify its proposed design for their new headquarters to include bird-safe glass on lower-level floors that reflect adjacent green space. This small change will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor will it substantially change the costs of construction. However, by incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams will be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds.

Research has documented that light from urban areas affect landscape-scale stopover decisions by migratory birds. The Lake Erie coastline is already an important migratory stopover location, and because of its position on the landscape and bright nighttime skyline, Cleveland attracts

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

millions of migratory birds every year. Reflective glass in urban centers has devastating consequences to migratory birds. Collisions with buildings are a leading cause of bird fatality during migration in North America, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions. Due to increasing building collisions, there is a “Lights Out” program that is dedicated to rescuing birds injured by glass collisions each morning in downtown Cleveland.

The gravity of the problem has been recognized by a growing public, including building industry professionals such as architects, developers, glass manufacturers, and landscape designers. Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies. Cities across North America, beginning with Toronto and now including New York City, have enacted mandatory legislation for bird-safe building practices and materials for new construction that have reduced collisions up to 100%. Dr. Daniel Klem, a U.S. ornithologist known for his pioneering research into the mortality of birds due to glass windows, explained: “An obvious prediction, as awareness of the problem and growing solution continue to emerge, is that legislation to protect birds from sheet glass will grow accordingly until it is required everywhere.”

The Cleveland’s Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability provides: “Buildings and properties should be designed and construction to minimize energy consumption and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources.” Birds are valuable natural resources for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. In addition, U.S. birdwatching brings in an estimated 15 billion dollars a year in eco-tourism and Cleveland can benefit from promoting itself as a “bird-friendly city”. Even more, the negative attention that could be brought to the city from bird mortality events could be detrimental, similar to that of the new Minnesota Vikings stadium.

Having a creative company like Sherwin-Williams use bird-friendly materials in its headquarters will serve as a paradigm for other companies to model themselves after and would be a major step towards Cleveland becoming a bird-friendly, green city and a leader throughout the region and country. Thank you for considering this important matter.

Sincerely,

Sam O’Connell, Joel Throckmorton, Nora Gallagher
Natural Resource Specialists
Parks and Recreation Department
City of Mentor

Cc: Jack Bialosky, Chair, City of Cleveland Planning Commission, Downtown/Flats Design Review District
Anthony Santora, Administrator, Downtown/Flats Design Review Committee
Giancarlo Calicchia, Vice Chair, Landmarks Commission
Freddy L Collier, Jr., Director of Planning, City of Cleveland
Ed Rybka, Chief of Regional Development, City of Cleveland
Jason Wood, Chief of Sustainability, City of Cleveland

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

From: August Froehlich

Sent: Tuesday, November 23, 2021 2:32 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ

David Bowen, Chairman
City of Cleveland Planning Commission
Cleveland City Hall
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 501
Cleveland, OH 44114

RE:

Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ
Downtown Cleveland/Jacobs Block & Weston Block

Dear Chairman Bowen:

The Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative is a network of organizations dedicated to the conservation of birds and we would like to urge the Cleveland Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company make minor modifications to its proposed design for their new headquarters that would include bird-safe glass on lower-level floors that reflect adjacent green space. These small changes will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor will they substantially change the costs of construction. However, by incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams will be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds.

Research has documented that light from urban areas affect decisions by migratory birds about where to stop. The Lake Erie coastline is a globally important migratory stopover location, and because of its position on the landscape and bright nighttime skyline, Cleveland attracts millions of migratory birds every year. Reflective glass in urban centers has devastating consequences to migratory birds. Collisions with buildings are a leading cause of bird fatality, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions. In the case of Cleveland, researchers and volunteers through the Lights Out program have salvaged more than 12,000 dead and injured birds from the downtown area in just the past 5 years.

The gravity of the problem has been recognized by a growing public, including building industry professionals such as architects, developers, glass manufacturers, and landscape designers. Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies. Cities across North America, beginning with Toronto and now including New York City, have enacted legislation for mandatory bird-safe building practices

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

and materials for new construction that have reduced collisions up to 100%. Dr. Daniel Klem, a U.S. ornithologist known for his pioneering research into the mortality of birds due to glass windows, explained: “An obvious prediction, as awareness of the problem and growing solution continue to emerge, is that legislation to protect birds from sheet glass will grow accordingly until it is required everywhere.”

The Cleveland’s Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability provides: “Buildings and properties should be designed and constructed to minimize energy consumption and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources.” Birds are a natural resource, and valuable for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. In addition to the countless ecological benefits, they further boost local economies via birdwatching, hunting, and ecotourism, for which Cleveland is often touted.

Having a creative company like Sherwin-Williams use bird-friendly materials in its headquarters would truly lead to Cleveland becoming a bird-friendly green city and a leader in sustainability throughout the region and country. Thank you for considering this important matter. Please feel free to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

August Froehlich

Chair, Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative

Cc:

Jack Bialosky, Chair, City of Cleveland Planning Commission, Downtown/Flats Design Review District

Anthony Santora, Administrator, Downtown/Flats Design Review Committee

Giancarlo Calicchia, Vice Chair, Landmarks Commission

Freddy L Collier, Jr., Director of Planning, City of Cleveland

Ed Rybka, Chief of Regional Development, City of Cleveland

Jason Wood, Chief of Sustainability, City of Cleveland

From: Paul Alozano

Sent: Wednesday, November 10, 2021 12:20 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Attention: David Bowen, Chairman, City of Cleveland Planning Commission

November 10, 2021

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Attached is my letter with comments regarding the review and approval of architects' plans for the Sherwin-Williams complex in downtown Cleveland. Hard copies will be mailed today to all concerned parties listed.

Paula Lozano
1291 Granger Avenue
Lakewood, OH 44107

Attachment:

November 10, 2021

Paula Lozano
1291 Granger Avenue
Lakewood, OH 44107

David Bowen, Chairman
City of Cleveland Planning Commission
Cleveland City Hall
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 501
Cleveland, OH 44114

Dear Mr. Bowen,

As a concerned citizen of Cuyahoga County and a long-time bird-watcher, I am writing to submit my personal comments before your meeting at the end of November. I understand these comments will be added to others from the public before the architects' plans for the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters complex in downtown Cleveland are reviewed and granted final approval.

Most of all I want to learn about the glass to be used in the construction of the office tower and adjacent buildings. How much is there and, most importantly, what kind of glass will be used? Is that information available to the public now?

By choosing **bird-friendly glass** before construction begins, the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters will help birds survive as they migrate through Cleveland, not kill more of them. I encourage each member of the Planning Commission to read *Designing Buildings with Smart Bird-safe Windows*, <https://view.com/blog/save-millions-of-birds>, a short article about incorporating **bird-friendly glass** in the construction of buildings. Here is a quote from that article:

Bird-safe designs are critical architectural and design requirements in modern commercial real estate. Across North America, new guidelines for bird-safe buildings are now the norm. LEED certification, the leading benchmark in green building, has added bird collision deterrence to its credits and reports a significant increase in interest in the program. Many metropolitan areas are making bird-friendly glass mandatory, such as Chicago, Illinois, New York, and Washington DC, in the United States and major metro areas like Toronto in Canada.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

I envision Sherwin-Williams, an innovative organization, incorporating this information in its planning, obtaining LEED status and joining other buildings and companies in Cleveland's Lights Out program - <https://ohiolightsout.org/cities/lights-out-cleveland/>; Being recognized as a leader in the environmental field will be a feather in the company's hat, as well as a life saver for the millions of birds that live or migrate through Cleveland.

Sincerely,

Paula Lozano
Lakewood, Ohio

From: Ken Vinciquerra

Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2021 1:18 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Comment on CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin-Williams Company Corporate HQ

Dear Mr. Bowen and Members

We are Cleveland residents and avid bird-watchers who have been following the reports of the design for the proposed Sherwin-Williams headquarters in downtown Cleveland.

Today's report in **Crain's Cleveland Business** notes that "*The company decided against [landscaped roof] greenery, though, due to advice from an avian consultant who is working with the project team to discourage birds from nesting on, and potentially flying into, the buildings.*"

This action on the part of Sherwin-Williams, while well-intentioned, misses the **much larger issue**: 10,000 dead birds have been recorded in a monitored area of downtown Cleveland since 2017 (source: Lights Out Cleveland), killed not because of green roofs, but because of untreated glass exteriors.

I understand that the Cleveland Planning Commission will be meeting at the end of November to review and seek final approval for the buildings and architectural materials. At this meeting I encourage the Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company's architects use **bird-safe glass** on the buildings and, during spring and fall peak bird migration, **modify the building's lighting**. Lighting, combined with reflections of trees and sky in reflective glass building materials, confuse migratory birds causing them to misinterpret windows leading to the collisions.

Bird-safe glass and decreased lighting makes the structure visible to migratory birds, thus reducing or eliminating collisions. Research at the Powdermill Avian Research Center in western Pennsylvania has found that birds avoid glass that has been coated with a patterned, U-V reflective glaze. The Javits Center in New York City reduced bird collisions by 90% when the building was renovated and fitted with bird-safe glass. Another recent well-publicized example is the Milwaukee Bucks arena, designed with Bird-Friendly Glass (<https://blog.bluebeam.com/bird-friendly-arena/>)

Birds add enjoyment to our lives, and play a critical role in the web of life as seed dispersers, plant pollinators, and controls on insects and rodents. Having Sherwin-Williams, a creative and

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

well-established company, use bird-safe materials in its headquarters in downtown Cleveland would clearly show its leadership role to other companies in Cleveland, throughout Ohio, the U.S. and the world. Additionally, with the Planning Commission's urging, the Sherwin-Williams Company would be an environmental leader - becoming a bird-friendly company in a green city on a blue lake. Thank you for considering this important matter.

Sincerely,
Kenneth Vinciguerra and Dr. Louise Acheson

From: Mike Watson

Sent: Friday, November 26, 2021 10:10 AM

To: City Planning

Subject: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company HQ

Please see attached letter regarding the Sherwin Williams headquarters.

Thank you,

Mike Watson

Attachment:

26 November 2021

RE: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ
Downtown Cleveland/Jacobs Block & Weston Block

Dear Chairman Bowen:

I am writing to urge the Cleveland Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin Williams Company modify the proposed design of its new headquarters to make it more bird-friendly. I applaud Sherwin Williams' decision to build their headquarters in Cleveland and recognize it as a positive development for northeast Ohio. However, some design features make the building particularly hazardous to migratory birds.

Collisions with buildings are a leading cause of bird fatality during migration in North America, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions. *Light combined with reflections of trees or clouds in reflective glass building materials confuse migratory birds causing them to misinterpret windows in open areas leading to collisions with buildings. However, there a solution that greatly reduce the number of collisions: using bird-safe glass, which incorporates patterns to make the glass more visible to birds, in the lower floors of the building.*

NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION PUBLIC COMMENTS

Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies in response to growing recognition of this problem within the public, the conservation community, and the building industry.

Cities, including Toronto and New York City, have responded to the issue by enacting legislation for bird-safe building practices and it is likely that this will become standard across North America. Cleveland (and Sherwin Williams) is positioned to be on this leading edge of bird-safe design and set the standard for the Great Lakes region.

The Cleveland Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability states: “Buildings and properties should be designed and constructed to minimize energy consumption and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources.” Birds are valuable natural resources for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. They also benefit us in less tangible ways (beauty, inspiration, recreation) and birdwatching in northern Ohio is an economically and culturally important activity.

Cleveland’s position on Lake Erie has been vital to its national position in manufacturing, shipping and travel. Unfortunately, its history has not always been stellar from an environmental perspective. The proximity to Lake Erie also makes Cleveland an important location during bird migration, and I look forward to seeing Cleveland and Sherwin Williams embrace this by becoming more bird-friendly as the city continues to demonstrate improvements and innovations in sustainability and conservation.

Sincerely,
Mike Watson
Steering Committee - Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative
Area Contact and former President - Ohio Bluebird Society

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

From: Katarina Cerny

Sent: Wednesday, November 24, 2021 5:49 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company HQ

Cleveland/Lake Erie is a major flyway for migrating birds. In the past 5 migration seasons 12,000 collisions and over 8,000 bird deaths have been recorded.

We know Sherwin Williams is a leader in our community, and request that they take the lead environmentally by constructing their headquarters by using bird-safe glass in the lower 75 feet of their structures. When birds are in migratory flight, and they see grass/trees reflected in glass, they can become confused and fly right into windows. Bird-safe glass blurs that reflection and minimizes the opportunity for avian confusion.

Thank you.

Katarina Cerny

From: Michelle Manzo

Sent: Monday, November 29, 2021 8:43 AM

To: City Planning

Subject: Sherwin Williams Global Headquarters

The proposed Sherwin-Williams Global Headquarters is a stunning complex that will transform Public Square. However, if not done properly, the addition of a 36 story glass building with glass satellite structures and raised walkways connecting them has the potential to be a death trap for migrating birds.

Each year millions of migrating birds are killed or injured in the US as a result of collisions with buildings. Songbirds migrate at night and are often disoriented and drawn into cities by artificial lights, particularly around tall buildings. Once drawn in, many birds become confused and exhausted, and often collide with buildings. Those that escape collisions often end up feeding and resting in green spaces during daylight hours. Glass surfaces adjacent to green spaces are especially hazardous as birds do not perceive glass as an obstacle and are unable to differentiate between a reflection and suitable habitat. As a volunteer monitor for Lights Out Cleveland, I have personally witnessed conditions where literally dozens of birds drop out of the sky within minutes as they collide with reflective glass surfaces.

Fortunately, there are numerous options for bird safe/bird friendly glass that mitigate this hazard at a modest cost, especially when incorporated during the planning phase. These products, barely visible to the human eye, alert the birds to the presence of the glass barrier and dramatically reduce collisions and fatalities. Implementation of these solutions means we can eliminate those days where scores of birds meet their end in downtown Cleveland.

Please consider this as you review the final plans for the construction of the Sherwin Williams Global Headquarters that will transform the heart of the city. The incorporation of bird friendly solutions in the proposed construction is a huge opportunity for Sherwin Williams and the City of Cleveland to become leaders in sustainability for the region. In addition, updating building codes

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

to incorporate bird safe/bird friendly design considerations throughout the city will go a long way to secure that leadership role and demonstrate Cleveland's commitment to sustainability.

Michelle Manzo

From: Geoff Dougherty
Sent: Monday, November 8, 2021 12:19 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin Williams new building on public square

AM disappointed with the design. They had one chance to really do something special to transform public square, but it appears the design decision was by group consensus I. E. No one is happy. It's their money and they can do as they please, but the City may want to have more input for future projects in highly visible locations around town.

From: Matthew Murphy
Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 8:02 AM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin Williams Project

Good Morning,

I would ask that you schedule another meeting regarding this project that actually gives you enough time to discuss the elements of this plan without rushing into a vote.

I realize you have already approved the pavilion on public square. It became obvious in the last meeting, however, that they cannot conceptually justify the design of such a building. Downtown should demand its buildings be substantial and built up to the street. The center city needs density and a 40 foot tall conference room set back from both superior and the square is pure vanity on the part of SHW and an insult to the City.

I understand the need to be pragmatic and the need to be accommodating to the developer, but they have not conceded a single point and have not adjusted their plan at all throughout this process. They say they want to be a strong corporate member of this community, but their headquarters project does not display this sentiment in any way.

At least ask them if their 'park' in front of the 'pavilion' will be open to the public. They gave the impression that it would not be. Also, make sure the landscape of this plan is accommodating to all the bus stops that line their property.

Honestly, you shouldn't approve the surface lots, either. They aren't developing a sea of parking like we are constantly assured they are doing. They are only developing 2/5 of the parking and keeping the rest.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

I am not hopeful, but I do hope you reconsider the approval of the pavilion building. It has no relationship with any of the other buildings on the square and it's so short, you won't even be able to see it until you are west of Ontario.

Thank You,
Matt

From: Debra Klein
Sent: Wednesday, November 24, 2021 1:45 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin Williams proposed building

Greetings,
As you consider the proposal for the Sherwin Williams downtown headquarters, please consider the environmental impact on migrating birds.

Lights Out Cleveland is an organization dedicated to monitoring bird strikes during spring & fall migration, and to working with business/building owners & managers to minimize human effects on bird death. Cleveland/Lake Erie is a major flyway for migrating birds. In the 5 migration seasons Lights Out has been collecting data here, nearly 12,000 collisions & over 8k deaths have been recorded.

We know Sherwin Williams is a leader in our community, and request that they take the lead environmentally by constructing their headquarters by using bird-safe glass in the lower 75 feet of their structures. When birds are in migratory flight, and they see grass/trees reflected in glass, they can become confused and fly right into windows. Bird-safe glass blurs that reflection and minimizes the opportunity for avian confusion.

Thank you for your kind consideration.

Sincerely,
Debra Klein

From: Fred Losi
Sent: Sunday, November 21, 2021 1:57 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin-Williams headquarters Feedback

Greetings,
I am emailing to show support for both the Kirtland Bird Club and Western Cuyahoga Audubon in providing valuable feedback encouraging the use of bird-safe glass in construction of the Sherwin-Williams headquarters. Below is their position and aligned with responsible construction techniques and the goals of conservation.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

I understand that the Cleveland Planning Commission will be meeting at the end of November to review and seek final approval for the buildings and architectural materials. At this meeting encourage the Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company's architects use **bird-safe glass** on the buildings and **modify the building's lighting** in the spring and fall during peak bird migration. Lighting, combined with reflections of trees and sky in reflective glass building materials, confuse migratory birds causing them to misinterpret windows leading to the collisions. Bird-safe glass and decreased lighting makes the structure visible to migratory birds, thus reducing or eliminating collisions.

Research at the Powdermill Avian Research Center in western Pennsylvania has found that birds avoid glass that has been coated with a patterned, U-V reflective glaze. The Javits Center in New York City reduced bird collisions by 90% when the building was renovated and fitted with bird-safe glass. In Cleveland, the Cleveland State University Law Library installed bird-friendly film on entryway windows with promising results. Bird-friendly glass, like other window glass products, minimizes energy consumption too.

Birds add enjoyment to our lives, are valuable as seed dispersers, plant pollinators, and play vital roles in controlling insects and rodents. Having Sherwin-Williams, a creative and well-established company, use bird-safe materials in its headquarters in downtown Cleveland would clearly show its leadership role to other companies in Cleveland, throughout Ohio, the U.S. and the world. Additionally, with the Planning Commission's urging, the Sherwin-Williams Company would be an environmental leader - becoming a bird-friendly company in a green city on a blue lake. Thank you for considering this important matter.

Thanks!
Fred Losi

From: James Brown
Sent: Sunday, November 21, 2021 6:46 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin-Williams New HQ in Cleveland

City Planners-

We are writing as concerned citizens and avid birdwatchers in regard to the proposed Sherwin-Williams headquarters in downtown Cleveland. I understand that the Cleveland Planning Commission will be meeting at the end of November to review and seek final approval for the buildings and architectural materials. At this meeting I encourage the Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company's architects use **bird-safe glass** on the buildings and **modify the building's lighting** in the spring and fall during peak bird migration. Lighting, combined with reflections of trees and sky in reflective glass building materials, confuse migratory birds causing them to misinterpret windows leading to the collisions. Bird-safe glass and decreased lighting makes the structure visible to migratory birds, thus reducing or eliminating collisions.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Research at the Powdermill Avian Research Center in western Pennsylvania has found that birds avoid glass that has been coated with a patterned, U-V reflective glaze. The Javits Center in New York City reduced bird collisions by 90% when the building was renovated and fitted with bird-safe glass. In Cleveland, the Cleveland State University Law Library installed bird-friendly film on entryway windows with promising results. Bird-friendly glass, like other window glass products, minimizes energy consumption too.

Birds add enjoyment to our lives, are valuable as seed dispersers, plant pollinators, and play vital roles in controlling insects and rodents. Having Sherwin-Williams, a creative and well-established company, use bird-safe materials in its headquarters in downtown Cleveland would clearly show its leadership role to other companies in Cleveland, throughout Ohio, the U.S. and the world.

Additionally, with the Planning Commission's urging, the Sherwin-Williams Company would be an environmental leader - becoming a bird-friendly company in a green city on a blue lake. Thank you for considering this important matter.

Sincerely,

Laura & Jim Brown
Akron, OH

From: William T. Kerrigan
Sent: Sunday, November 27, 2021 2:23 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: The Planned Sherwin-Williams headquarters

Dear Mr. Bowen,

I'd like to share with you a letter of concern from the Ohio Ornithological Society regarding the proposed design of the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters to be built in downtown Cleveland. The decision to build the new headquarters in downtown Cleveland is a big win for the city. But we think that with some modest tweaks to the proposed design to make this new headquarters bird-friendly, this can be a win for the city, the company, and the birds of Ohio. Many American cities are now requiring bird-friendly design elements in new construction, and we'd like to see Cleveland get on board with this new initiative. Experts on bird-friendly glass have been in communication with Sherwin-Williams. We hope that you will press the company to adopt their recommendations.

If you have any questions, don't hesitate to reach out.

Thank you for your time.

William Kerrigan
Conservation Committee Chair, Ohio Ornithological Society.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS****Attachment:**

November 22, 2021

An Open Letter to Cleveland Officials regarding the planned construction of a new Sherwin-Williams headquarters.

The Ohio Ornithological Society is pleased to learn that Sherwin-Williams' and the city of Cleveland are working together on a plan for a new Sherwin-Williams headquarters building in downtown Cleveland. Since it was founded shortly after the Civil War, Sherwin-Williams has been an important part of Cleveland's history, and this commitment to the city's future is appreciated. While we applaud the decision to remain in Cleveland, we wanted to share some concerns about the proposed design of the new headquarters, which does not currently include bird-friendly elements.

A long-term study published in the September 2019 issue of *Science* magazine found that the breeding bird population in the United States and Canada has declined by 29%, or roughly three billion birds, since 1970. While there are multiple factors contributing to this dramatic decline, window strikes are one of the leading causes of bird deaths. Collisions occur when birds in flight try to reach habitat behind buildings or when habitat or the sky is reflected in the glass. It is estimated that one in two strikes results in a fatality. As awareness of the dangers window strikes pose to bird populations has increased, individual citizens and whole communities have responded by embracing changes to buildings to make them more bird-friendly. Modest design changes can reduce bird window strike deaths by up to 90%. New York and San Francisco, as well as an increasing number of smaller cities have already implemented requirements that new buildings adopt bird-friendly design elements in order to mitigate this problem. While retrofitting structures that were built without bird-friendly windows can be difficult and expensive, incorporating bird-friendly elements into new construction is relatively easy, and less costly.

Sherwin-Williams' continued commitment to Cleveland is appreciated, as are its recent efforts to protect the environment, as recognized by the EPA when it awarded the company's Breen Technology Center a Gold Level Environmental Excellence Award in 2015. The new downtown headquarters offers Sherwin-Williams a perfect opportunity to strengthen those commitments to good environmental stewardship by adopting bird-friendly design elements. By doing so, Sherwin-Williams can become recognized as a leader in the movement to restore healthy bird populations in North America, and this would also increase awareness of the Cleveland area, which is well known for its incredible species diversity and its important role within the Great Lakes migration corridor.

There are additional benefits to Sherwin-Williams by implementing bird-friendly designs. The company can save money in the long term due to energy savings associated with reduced lighting, reflective glass, etc. For example, the Jacob K. Javits Convention Center, which historically had some of the highest numbers of collisions, enjoyed energy savings up to 25%

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

after implementing bird friendly designs. These designs will also garner public support, generate positive press, and reduce negative press. Bird-watching is among the fastest-growing hobbies in the nation, and as more people are drawn to the hobby, they will be looking to support companies with bird-friendly reputations. We are happy that Sherwin-Williams has chosen Cleveland to be the site of their headquarters, and we believe that a few tweaks in their planning could benefit bird populations, the company, and the greater Cleveland area.

Officials at Sherwin-Williams have been in communication with Harvey Webster from the Cleveland Museum of Natural History, David Hollister of the Lights Out Cleveland program, and Chris Shepperd of the American Bird Conservancy, and these organizations have provided Sherwin-Williams with some recommendations regarding the use of bird-safe glass in their new headquarters. We ask that city officials responsible for approving the construction of the new building will ask Sherwin-Williams to adopt these recommendations and make them part of their construction plans. We look forward to hearing from you.

With Respect,

Tim Colborn
President, Ohio Ornithological Society

William Kerrigan
Interim Conservation Chair
From: Martha Reynard
Sent: Wednesday, September 15, 2021 7:26 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: The Sherwin Williams building

Cleveland City Planning Commission,

The Sherwin Williams planned new building does look impressive, however 36 stories of reflective glass would be a murderous nightmare for migrating birds, bats, butterflies, dragonflies and many other species that move through Northeast Ohio every Spring and Fall. Is it possible to get a commitment for them to use the Bird-Safe glass which has patterns to break up the reflection so non-human species can recognize and avoid the danger? When migrating wildlife sees a reflection of sky, clouds, trees, etc they cannot tell the difference and many are killed from collisions with these glass buildings. Ohio has "Lights Out" programs in most major cities which encourage building owners and managers to turn off lights between midnight and dawn during peak migration months. However, once the sun rises, many are killed by colliding with the glass reflections that look just like the natural environment. Please make this a requirement for approval. If you need more information on the amount of birds and bats killed by building collisions, please visit the Lights Out Ohio website.

Thank you,
Martha Reynard

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

From: Patricia Kellner

Sent: Wednesday, November 24, 2021 4:02 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Letter to City Planning Commission members - attached - URGENT!

Mr. Bosar and Mr. Santora -

Please distribute to members of the City Planning Commission and the Downtown/Flats Design Review Committee.

Thank you.

Patricia Kellner, MD

President, Kirtland Bird Club of Northeast Ohio

Attachment:

Members of the Cleveland Planning Commission:

David Bowen (chair)

Diane Downing

August Fluker

Charles Slife,

Ward 17 council member

Lillian Kuri

Greetings!

I am writing to you as a long time resident of greater Cleveland, and President of the Kirtland Bird Club of Northeast Ohio about the design plan for your new headquarters. I understand from Crain's Cleveland Business that Sherwin Williams used an avian consultant to help choose a roof that would be safer for birds and develop a plan to reduce lighting during migration, and I applaud them for that. However, even more important than those modifications is their decision on window material. Hopefully the design you approve includes **bird-safe glass for the new Sherwin Williams headquarters in Cleveland.**

Bird-window collisions are an established problem in Cleveland. Lights Out Cleveland collected over 5000 birds that stuck downtown Cleveland buildings in just four years. Most of these birds died.

Bird-safe glass not only helps migratory birds avoid window collisions, but it also reduces heating costs and improves worker productivity through reduced eye strain.

More than 270 species of birds are typically seen each year at the Cleveland lakefront parks just to the east and just to the west of downtown. Many of the birds that travel through Cleveland

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

make roundtrips between the tropics of Central and South America and the colder areas of North America while others winter in Cleveland and fly farther north in summer. Thus, the birds we see are not just Cleveland migratory birds, but international migratory birds.

Bird populations are in severe decline. According to a study published in Science, there are 3 billion less birds in the sky than there were 50 years ago. Bird-window collisions are felt to be the second most common cause of bird deaths. (Outdoor cats are the first.)

Cities around the country are starting to step up to protect birds by enacting ordinances that require bird-safe construction – and for good reason. Bird safe glass dramatically reduces bird-window collisions.

Kirtland Bird Club to Sherwin Williams – page 2 of 2

Installing bird-safe, energy-saving, employee-friendly glass looks to me to be a win-win for birds, birders, Sherwin William's employees, environmental impact, image, and bottom line, and Cleveland.

Please feel free to get in touch if I can provide additional information or answer any questions. I'd also be happy to email you a link with the references I've listed below – or go to this link on our website: <https://www.kirtlandbirdclub.org/references-sherwin-williams.html>

Sincerely,

Patricia Kellner, MD
President, Kirtland Bird Club
Kirtlandbirdclub.org

Statistics and References

- 3 billion birds gone - https://www.allaboutbirds.org/news/vanishing-1-in-4-birds-gone/?_hstc=161696355.c3255b423cb819dcbf0021cfb90da9e2.1637785285150.1637785285150.1637785285150.1&_hssc=161696355.1.1637785285151&_hsfp=2832920808&_gl=1*vay6y7*_ga*Nzg2MTgyMTYzLjE2Mzc3ODUyODQ.*_ga_QR4NVXZ8BM*MTYzNzc4NTI4My4xLjAuMTYzNzc4NTI4My42MA..#_ga=2.225659802.1829274656.1637785284-786182163.1637785284
- Successes of Lights Out in Cleveland (28 buildings/companies) & Implementation of Safe Glass in Northeast Ohio & elsewhere
 - <https://ohiolightsout.org/cities/lights-out-cleveland/>
 - CSU Law Library - <https://www.csuohio.edu/news/law-library-installs-bird-friendly-film-entryway-glass> - 100% reduction in downed birds

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

- Designing Buildings with Smart Bird-safe Windows, <https://view.com/blog/save-millions-of-birds>, a short article about incorporating bird-friendly glass in the construction of buildings.
- New York's Javits Center – impact of retrofitting with bird safe glass - Javits Center in NY with Bird-Friendly Retrofitted Glass
<https://www.nytimes.com/2015/09/05/nyregion/making-the-javits-center-less-deadly-for-birds.html>
- Environmental impact - energy cost savings - <https://www.fws.gov/birds/bird-enthusiasts/threats-to-birds/collisions/buildings-and-glass.php> “Etching, fritting, and frosting not only reduce the risk of bird collisions but also reduce energy costs by reducing solar heat gain (27 SHGC) and reducing cooling loads.”
- 354 species of birds observed in Cuyahoga County - top 4 birding hotspots are on the Cleveland lakefront - <https://ebird.org/region/US-OH-035/hotspots?yr=all&m=>
- 130,000 checklists have been submitted to ebird from Cuyahoga County by 5000 birders
- 45 million bird watchers nationwide - <https://www.fws.gov//birds/bird-enthusiasts/bird-watching.php>
- Economic impact of bird watching - <https://www.fws.gov/birds/bird-enthusiasts/bird-watching/valuing-birds.php>

From: Donald Petit

Sent: Monday, November 29, 2021 8:49 AM

To: City Planning

Subject: Letters re Sherwin-Williams HQ Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative

<https://shared-assets.adobe.com/link/f6afcff5-3d1c-4333-4c4e-aed62c5a3f3f>

Donald Petit

Secretary

Cleveland Landmarks Commission

From: William T. Kerrigan

Sent: Saturday, November 27, 2021 2:32 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Proposed Sherwin-Williams headquarters

Dear Mr. Santora,

I'd like to share with you a letter of concern from the Ohio Ornithological Society regarding the proposed design of the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters to be built in downtown Cleveland. The decision to build the new headquarters in downtown Cleveland is a big win for the city. But we think that with some modest tweaks to the proposed design to make this new headquarters

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

bird-friendly, this can be a win for the city, the company, and the birds of Ohio. Many American cities are now requiring bird-friendly design elements in new construction, and we'd like to see Cleveland get on board with this new initiative. Experts on bird-friendly glass have been in communication with Sherwin-Williams. We hope that you will press the company to adopt their recommendations.

If you have any questions, don't hesitate to reach out.

Thank you for your time.

William Kerrigan
Conservation Committee Chair, Ohio Ornithological Society.

Attachment:

November 22, 2021

An Open Letter to Cleveland Officials regarding the planned construction of a new Sherwin-Williams headquarters.

The Ohio Ornithological Society is pleased to learn that Sherwin-Williams' and the city of Cleveland are working together on a plan for a new Sherwin-Williams headquarters building in downtown Cleveland. Since it was founded shortly after the Civil War, Sherwin-Williams has been an important part of Cleveland's history, and this commitment to the city's future is appreciated. While we applaud the decision to remain in Cleveland, we wanted to share some concerns about the proposed design of the new headquarters, which does not currently include bird-friendly elements.

A long-term study published in the September 2019 issue of *Science* magazine found that the breeding bird population in the United States and Canada has declined by 29%, or roughly three billion birds, since 1970. While there are multiple factors contributing to this dramatic decline, window strikes are one of the leading causes of bird deaths. Collisions occur when birds in flight try to reach habitat behind buildings or when habitat or the sky is reflected in the glass. It is estimated that one in two strikes results in a fatality. As awareness of the dangers window strikes pose to bird populations has increased, individual citizens and whole communities have responded by embracing changes to buildings to make them more bird-friendly. Modest design changes can reduce bird window strike deaths by up to 90%. New York and San Francisco, as well as an increasing number of smaller cities have already implemented requirements that new buildings adopt bird-friendly design elements in order to mitigate this problem. While retrofitting structures that were built without bird-friendly windows can be difficult and expensive, incorporating bird-friendly elements into new construction is relatively easy, and less costly.

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Sherwin-William's continued commitment to Cleveland is appreciated, as are its recent efforts to protect the environment, as recognized by the EPA when it awarded the company's Breen Technology Center a Gold Level Environmental Excellence Award in 2015. The new downtown headquarters offers Sherwin-Williams a perfect opportunity to strengthen those commitments to good environmental stewardship by adopting bird-friendly design elements. By doing so, Sherwin-Williams can become recognized as a leader in the movement to restore healthy bird populations in North America, and this would also increase awareness of the Cleveland area, which is well known for its incredible species diversity and its important role within the Great Lakes migration corridor.

There are additional benefits to Sherwin-Williams by implementing bird-friendly designs. The company can save money in the long term due to energy savings associated with reduced lighting, reflective glass, etc. For example, the Jacob K. Javits Convention Center, which historically had some of the highest numbers of collisions, enjoyed energy savings up to 25% after implementing bird friendly designs. These designs will also garner public support, generate positive press, and reduce negative press. Bird-watching is among the fastest-growing hobbies in the nation, and as more people are drawn to the hobby, they will be looking to support companies with bird-friendly reputations. We are happy that Sherwin-Williams has chosen Cleveland to be the site of their headquarters, and we believe that a few tweaks in their planning could benefit bird populations, the company, and the greater Cleveland area.

Officials at Sherwin-Williams have been in communication with Harvey Webster from the Cleveland Museum of Natural History, David Hollister of the Lights Out Cleveland program, and Chris Shepperd of the American Bird Conservancy, and these organizations have provided Sherwin-Williams with some recommendations regarding the use of bird-safe glass in their new headquarters. We ask that city officials responsible for approving the construction of the new building will ask Sherwin-Williams to adopt these recommendations and make them part of their construction plans. We look forward to hearing from you.

With Respect,

Tim Colborn
President, Ohio Ornithological Society

William Kerrigan
Interim Conservation Chair

From: Matthew B. Shumar
Sent: Wednesday, November 24, 2021 10:57 AM
To: City Planning
Subject: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Dear Chairman Bowen:

As an ornithologist with more than 20 years experience working with migratory birds, I am writing the Cleveland Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company make minor modifications to its proposed design for their new headquarters that would include bird-safe glass on lower-level floors that reflect adjacent green space. These small changes will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor will they substantially change the costs of construction. However, by incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams will be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds.

A growing body of scientific research has documented that light from urban areas affect decisions by migratory birds about where to stop. The Lake Erie coastline is a globally important migratory stopover location, and because of its position on the landscape and bright nighttime skyline, Cleveland attracts millions of migratory birds every year. Reflective glass in urban centers has devastating consequences to migratory birds. Collisions with buildings are a leading cause of bird fatality, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions. In the case of Cleveland, researchers and volunteers through the Lights Out program have salvaged more than 12,000 dead and injured birds from the downtown area in just the past 5 years.

The gravity of the problem has been recognized by a growing public, including building industry professionals such as architects, developers, glass manufacturers, and landscape designers. Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies, which are available online here: <https://www.glass.org/news/2021/nga-releases-new-bird-friendly-technical-design-guide>.

Further, the American Bird Conservancy has created a database of scientifically tested glass products available for commercial and residential use: <https://abcbirds.org/glass-collisions/products-database/>. Cities across North America, beginning with Toronto and now including New York City, have enacted legislation for mandatory bird-safe building practices and materials for new construction that have reduced collisions up to 100%. Dr. Daniel Klem, a U.S. ornithologist known for his pioneering research into the mortality of birds due to glass windows, explained: "An obvious prediction, as awareness of the problem and growing solution continue to emerge, is that legislation to protect birds from sheet glass will grow accordingly until it is required everywhere."

The Cleveland's Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability provides: "Buildings and properties should be designed and constructed to minimize energy consumption and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources." Birds are a natural resource, and valuable for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. In addition to the countless ecological benefits, they further boost local economies via birdwatching, hunting, and ecotourism, for which Cleveland is often touted. Birdwatching is one of the fastest growing recreational activities in the United States, and Cleveland hosts a large and vibrant birding

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

community

Having a creative company like Sherwin-Williams use bird-friendly materials in its headquarters would truly lead to Cleveland becoming a bird-friendly green city and a leader in sustainability throughout the region and country. Thank you for considering this important matter. Please do not hesitate to contact me if I can provide any additional information or support.

Sincerely,

Matthew B. Shumar

From: Edward Rybka

Sent: Friday, November 26, 2021 4:12 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Sherwin Williams, Stewardship, Sustainability and Migrating Birds

November 26, 2021

By email: cityplanning@clevelandohio.gov

RE: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ

Downtown Cleveland/Jacobs Block & Weston Block

Dear Chairman Bowen:

I am writing as a private citizen who is a real estate broker with Newmark for the past 16 years since moving back home. I would like to urge the Cleveland Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company tweak its proposed design for their new headquarters to include bird-safe glass from the ground up to the top of anticipated height of proximate vegetation. This is not a draconian request but a small change that will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor materially impact the construction costs. As Dr Christine Sheppard – who is Director, Glass Collisions Program for [American Bird Conservancy](#) and the author of the defining work on the subject* says “You can get the building that you want without killing birds.” By incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce bird-perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams would be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds and getting credit for being good citizens.

Research has documented that light from urban areas affect landscape-scale stopover decisions by migratory birds. The Lake Erie coastline is already an important migratory stopover location, and because of its position on the landscape, and bright nighttime skyline, Cleveland attracts millions of migratory birds every year. They settle in to green spaces for the night and fly to the nearest tree in the AM unaware that that tree is only a reflection. Reflective glass in urban centers has devastating consequences to migratory birds. Collisions with buildings are a leading cause

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

of bird fatality during migration in North America, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions.

The gravity of the problem has been steadily gaining awareness from a concerned public, including building industry professionals such as architects, developers, glass manufacturers, and landscape designers. Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies. Cities across North America, beginning with Toronto and now including New York City, have **enacted mandatory legislation for bird-safe building practices and materials for new construction that have reduced collisions up to 100%**. Dr. Daniel Klem, a U.S. ornithologist known for his pioneering research into the mortality of birds due to glass windows, explained: “An obvious prediction, as awareness of the problem and growing solution continue to emerge, is that legislation to protect birds from sheet glass will grow accordingly until it is required everywhere.”

The Cleveland’s Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability provides: “Buildings and properties should be designed and construction to minimize energy consumption and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources.” Birds are valuable natural resources for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. In addition to the countless ecological benefits, they further boost local economies via birdwatching and ecotourism, for which Cleveland is often touted for.

Having a creative company like Sherwin-Williams use bird-friendly materials in its headquarters would truly lead to Cleveland becoming a bird-friendly green city, and a leader throughout the region and country. Thank you for considering this important matter. Please feel free to contact me but if you have a desire to speak with someone far above my pay grade on the subject, I encourage you to reach out to Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative Program Coordinator Matt Shumar** and I am sure he would be glad to appear if invited.

* [Bird-Friendly Design Guide](#)

** Matthew B. Shumar

Program Coordinator, Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative

The Ohio State University School of Environment and Natural Resources

(614) 706-6224 / obcicoordinator@gmail.com

<https://obcinet.org/>

Sincerely,

David B. Hollister

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

From: Jack Bialosky, Jr.

Sent: Saturday, November 27, 2021 2:42 PM

To: City Planning

Subject: Sherwin Williams, Stewardship, Sustainability and Migrating Birds

Dear Mr. Bialosky,

I'd like to share with you a letter of concern from the Ohio Ornithological Society regarding the proposed design of the new Sherwin-Williams headquarters to be built in downtown Cleveland. The decision to build the new headquarters in downtown Cleveland is a big win for the city. But we think that with some modest tweaks to the proposed design to make this new headquarters bird-friendly, this can be a win for the city, the company, and the birds of Ohio. Many American cities are now requiring bird-friendly design elements in new construction, and we'd like to see Cleveland get on board with this new initiative. Experts on bird-friendly glass have been in communication with Sherwin-Williams. We hope that you will press the company to adopt their recommendations.

If you have any questions, don't hesitate to reach out.

Thank you for your time.

William Kerrigan

Conservation Committee Chair, Ohio Ornithological Society.

Attachment:**An Open Letter to Cleveland Officials regarding the planned construction of a new Sherwin-Williams headquarters.**

The Ohio Ornithological Society is pleased to learn that Sherwin-Williams' and the city of Cleveland are working together on a plan for a new Sherwin-Williams headquarters building in downtown Cleveland. Since it was founded shortly after the Civil War, Sherwin-Williams has been an important part of Cleveland's history, and this commitment to the city's future is appreciated. While we applaud the decision to remain in Cleveland, we wanted to share some concerns about the proposed design of the new headquarters, which does not currently include bird-friendly elements.

A long-term study published in the September 2019 issue of *Science* magazine found that the breeding bird population in the United States and Canada has declined by 29%, or roughly three billion birds, since 1970. While there are multiple factors contributing to this dramatic decline, window strikes are one of the leading causes of bird deaths. Collisions occur when birds in flight try to reach habitat behind buildings or when habitat or the sky is reflected in the glass. It is estimated that one in two strikes results in a fatality. As awareness of the dangers window strikes pose to bird populations has increased, individual citizens and whole communities have responded by embracing changes to buildings to make them more bird-friendly. Modest design

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

changes can reduce bird window strike deaths by up to 90%. New York and San Francisco, as well as an increasing number of smaller cities have already implemented requirements that new buildings adopt bird-friendly design elements in order to mitigate this problem. While retrofitting structures that were built without bird-friendly windows can be difficult and expensive, incorporating bird-friendly elements into new construction is relatively easy, and less costly.

Sherwin-William's continued commitment to Cleveland is appreciated, as are its recent efforts to protect the environment, as recognized by the EPA when it awarded the company's Breen Technology Center a Gold Level Environmental Excellence Award in 2015. The new downtown headquarters offers Sherwin-Williams a perfect opportunity to strengthen those commitments to good environmental stewardship by adopting bird-friendly design elements. By doing so, Sherwin-Williams can become recognized as a leader in the movement to restore healthy bird populations in North America, and this would also increase awareness of the Cleveland area, which is well known for its incredible species diversity and its important role within the Great Lakes migration corridor.

There are additional benefits to Sherwin-Williams by implementing bird-friendly designs. The company can save money in the long term due to energy savings associated with reduced lighting, reflective glass, etc. For example, the Jacob K. Javits Convention Center, which historically had some of the highest numbers of collisions, enjoyed energy savings up to 25% after implementing bird friendly designs. These designs will also garner public support, generate positive press, and reduce negative press. Bird-watching is among the fastest-growing hobbies in the nation, and as more people are drawn to the hobby, they will be looking to support companies with bird-friendly reputations. We are happy that Sherwin-Williams has chosen Cleveland to be the site of their headquarters, and we believe that a few tweaks in their planning could benefit bird populations, the company, and the greater Cleveland area.

Officials at Sherwin-Williams have been in communication with Harvey Webster from the Cleveland Museum of Natural History, David Hollister of the Lights Out Cleveland program, and Chris Shepperd of the American Bird Conservancy, and these organizations have provided Sherwin-Williams with some recommendations regarding the use of bird-safe glass in their new headquarters. We ask that city officials responsible for approving the construction of the new building will ask Sherwin-Williams to adopt these recommendations and make them part of their construction plans. We look forward to hearing from you.

With Respect,

Tim Colborn
President, Ohio Ornithological Society

William Kerrigan
Interim Conservation Chair

From: David hollister

Sent: Friday, November 26, 2021 12:17 PM

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

To: City Planning

Subject: Sherwin Williams, Stewardship, Sustainability and Migrating Birds

November 26, 2021

By email: cityplanning@clevelandohio.gov

RE: Downtown/Flats CASE # DF 2021-016, The Sherwin Williams Company Corporate HQ

Downtown Cleveland/Jacobs Block & Weston Block

Dear Chairman Bowen:

I am writing as a private citizen who is a real estate broker with Newmark for the past 16 years since moving back home. I would like to urge the Cleveland Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company tweak its proposed design for their new headquarters to include bird-safe glass from the ground up to the top of anticipated height of proximate vegetation. This is not a draconian request but a small change that will not compromise the designers' aesthetic vision, nor materially impact the construction costs. As Dr Christine Sheppard – who is Director, Glass Collisions Program for [American Bird Conservancy](#) and the author of the defining work on the subject* says “You can get the building that you want without killing birds.” By incorporating glass specifically designed to reduce bird-perceived reflectivity, Sherwin-Williams would be taking an important step to making Cleveland a safer city for migratory birds and getting credit for being good citizens.

Research has documented that light from urban areas affect landscape-scale stopover decisions by migratory birds. The Lake Erie coastline is already an important migratory stopover location, and because of its position on the landscape, and bright nighttime skyline, Cleveland attracts millions of migratory birds every year. They settle in to green spaces for the night and fly to the nearest tree in the AM unaware that that tree is only a reflection. Reflective glass in urban centers has devastating consequences to migratory birds. Collisions with buildings are a leading cause of bird fatality during migration in North America, and it is estimated that up to 1 billion birds die each year in North America from building collisions.

The gravity of the problem has been steadily gaining awareness from a concerned public, including building industry professionals such as architects, developers, glass manufacturers, and landscape designers. Organizations, such as the National Glass Association, have developed standards and guidelines for bird-friendly glass design strategies. Cities across North America, beginning with Toronto and now including New York City, have **enacted mandatory legislation for bird-safe building practices and materials for new construction that have reduced collisions up to 100%**. Dr. Daniel Klem, a U.S. ornithologist known for his pioneering research into the mortality of birds due to glass windows, explained: “An obvious prediction, as awareness of the problem and growing solution continue to emerge, is that legislation to protect birds from sheet glass will grow accordingly until it is required everywhere.”

The Cleveland's Planning Commission Design Guidelines, in 341.07(h) Sustainability provides: “Buildings and properties should be designed and construction to minimize energy consumption

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

and to promote conservation of materials and natural resources.” Birds are valuable natural resources for a number of environmental and economic reasons. They spread seeds, pollinate plants, and also play a vital role in controlling insects and rodents. In addition to the countless ecological benefits, they further boost local economies via birdwatching and ecotourism, for which Cleveland is often touted for.

Having a creative company like Sherwin-Williams use bird-friendly materials in its headquarters would truly lead to Cleveland becoming a bird-friendly green city, and a leader throughout the region and country. Thank you for considering this important matter. Please feel free to contact me but if you have a desire to speak with someone far above my pay grade on the subject, I encourage you to reach out to Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative Program Coordinator Matt Shumar** and I am sure he would be glad to appear if invited.

* [Bird-Friendly Design Guide](#)

** Matthew B. Shumar

Program Coordinator, Ohio Bird Conservation Initiative
The Ohio State University School of Environment and Natural Resources
(614) 706-6224 / obcicoordinator@gmail.com
<https://obcinet.org/>

Sincerely,
David B. Hollister

From: Julie A. West
Sent: Thursday, November 25, 2021 11:25 AM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin Williams HQ Design Comment

As an avid bird watcher for over thirty years, I find joy in seeing and hearing birds wherever I might be. As a Lights Out Cleveland volunteer, I experience anguish when finding birds injured or killed by striking buildings in Downtown Cleveland.

Since 2017, Lights Out Cleveland volunteers have collected over 10,000 birds that have collided with buildings in Downtown Cleveland during spring and fall migration. These collisions can be avoided by using bird-safe glass and bird-friendly glass design strategies, and by modifying buildings' lighting during spring and fall migration. At your November 30th meeting, I ask that that Cleveland Planning Commission request that Sherwin-Williams Company's architects use **bird-safe glass** and **enable the buildings' lighting** to be modified during spring and fall migration. These birds travel hundreds and sometimes thousands of miles each way during migration. Let's make Downtown Cleveland a place where they can rest and replenish their energy reserves, and then continue on their journey; not a dead end.

Thank you for your consideration,
Julie A. West

**NOVEMBER 2021 FINAL DESIGN SUBMISSION
PUBLIC COMMENTS**

From: Laura & Jim Brown
Sent: Sunday, November 21, 2021 6:46 PM
To: City Planning
Subject: Sherwin-Williams New HQ in Cleveland

City Planners-

We are writing as concerned citizens and avid birdwatchers in regard to the proposed Sherwin-Williams headquarters in downtown Cleveland. I understand that the Cleveland Planning Commission will be meeting at the end of November to review and seek final approval for the buildings and architectural materials. At this meeting I encourage the Planning Commission to request that the Sherwin-Williams Company's architects use **bird-safe glass** on the buildings and **modify the building's lighting** in the spring and fall during peak bird migration. Lighting, combined with reflections of trees and sky in reflective glass building materials, confuse migratory birds causing them to misinterpret windows leading to the collisions. Bird-safe glass and decreased lighting makes the structure visible to migratory birds, thus reducing or eliminating collisions.

Research at the Powdermill Avian Research Center in western Pennsylvania has found that birds avoid glass that has been coated with a patterned, U-V reflective glaze. The Javits Center in New York City reduced bird collisions by 90% when the building was renovated and fitted with bird-safe glass. In Cleveland, the Cleveland State University Law Library installed bird-friendly film on entryway windows with promising results. Bird-friendly glass, like other window glass products, minimizes energy consumption too.

Birds add enjoyment to our lives, are valuable as seed dispersers, plant pollinators, and play vital roles in controlling insects and rodents. Having Sherwin-Williams, a creative and well-established company, use bird-safe materials in its headquarters in downtown Cleveland would clearly show its leadership role to other companies in Cleveland, throughout Ohio, the U.S. and the world. Additionally, with the Planning Commission's urging, the Sherwin-Williams Company would be an environmental leader - becoming a bird-friendly company in a green city on a blue lake. Thank you for considering this important matter.

Sincerely,
Laura & Jim Brown
Akron, OH